

“Paper Presented at the 2019 ASN World Convention, Columbia University 2-4 May
2019”

“Do No Cite Without the Permission of the Author(s).”

The attacks of 11 September 2001 and 13 November 2015 in graphic memoirs: from
New York to Paris, the expression of a traumatic memory ?

Abstract :

The attacks of September 11 in New York and November 13 2015 in Paris were traumatic events, experienced and broadcast worldwide, marking the sudden entry into the 21st century. These events are now part of our collective memory, as illustrated by many books and films, such as Michael Moore's *Fahrenheit 9/11*. There are also realistic fiction comics on this subject, such as the series *9/11*, on the origins of September 11, or even documentaries, such as *13/11, Reconstruction of an attack, Paris, 13 November 2015*.

In this context, the production of comic strips made by witnesses to these events is particularly interesting. Indeed, the attacks of September 11 in New York and of November 13, 2015 in Paris gave rise to graphic memoirs, which express a personal memory of the attacks. On September 11, Henrik Rehr, a Danish cartoonist, lived with his family in Manhattan (*Mardi 11 septembre*, 2003). The husband of Alissa Torres, a young pregnant New Yorker, threw himself off one of the towers of the World Trade Center where he had started working the day before (*American Widow*, 2009). Art Spiegelman, renowned author of *Maus*, the only comic strip in the world to win a

Pulitzer Prize, in 1992, lived a few steps from Ground Zero (*In the Shadow of no Towers*, 2004). Steve McCurry, an American photographer, took his first pictures of southern Manhattan from the roof of his building before heading to the places of tragedy; some of them, striking, are reproduced in the album. McCurry was also at the Stade de France on November 13, 2015 (*McCurry, NY 11 Septembre 2001*, 2016). *Mon Bataclan*, the album of a French graphic designer, known under the pseudonym Fred Dewilde, echoes the photographer's testimony. For two hours, the author remained on the ground in the pit of the theatre, living among the dead. A graphic memoir is mainly based on the need to transmit a personal history. The intimate and personal nature of this type of book implies that a graphic memoir is, in most cases, the work of a single author, who directs the script, as well as the drawing and possibly the colour setting. The moral commitment, the involvement of the author in giving an accurate picture of the facts, both personal and historical, induces an important documentary research. Graphic memoirs are atypical on the substance and form, often include photographs and various documents which attest to the truth of the facts. The testimonies focus on the attacks and tell how the protagonists faced the events. Most of them show a traumatic experience and are not didactic. Graphic memoirs on attacks of September 11 in New York and November 13, 2015 in Paris, are works of individual memory that enrich collective memory.

On September 11, 2001, two airliners crashed into the twin towers of the World Trade Center in New York. On 13 November 2015, shootings and suicide attacks took place in Paris, notably at the Stade de France and the Bataclan. Authors, witnesses or victims of these terrorist attacks, recounted their experiences during these deadly events. These

comic strip testimonies, of which there are six, were published in France between 2002 and 2016. Four of them deal with 11 September 2001, one of the two attacks, the last one on 13 November 2015.

On September 11, 2001, Henrik Rehr, a Danish cartoonist, lived with his family in Manhattan (*Tuesday, September 11*, 2003). Alissa Torres' husband, a young pregnant New Yorker, threw himself off one of the towers of the World Trade Center where he had started working the day before (*American Widow*, September 2009). Sandrine Revel, a French author, was on site for a few days of vacation (*Le 11e jour*, 2002). The American Art Spiegelman, renowned author of *Maus*, the only comic strip in the world to win a Pulitzer Prize in 1992, lived a few steps from Ground zero (*In the Shadow of No Towers*, 2004). Steve McCurry, an American photographer, took his first pictures of southern Manhattan from the roof of his building before heading to the scene of the tragedy; some of them, striking, are reproduced in the album. McCurry was also at the Stade de France on 13 November 2015 (*McCurry, NY 11 September 2001*, 2016). *Mon Bataclan*, the album of a French graphic designer, known by his pseudonym, Fred Dewilde, echoes the photographer's testimony. For two hours, the author remained on the ground in the pit of the theatre, living among the dead. It should be noted that although this study concerns only testimonies, there are nevertheless realistic fictional comics on this subject, such as the 9/11 series, on the genesis of 11 September, or even documentaries such as 13/11, Reconstruction of an attack, Paris, 13 November 2015.

A personal memory of the attacks

In these stories, the author stages his own memory, even if it is embedded in a broader memory. This is an autobiographical practice as Philippe Lejeune conceives it and considers it to be a "rare and difficult act"¹. The author gives a retrospective account of his life or a significant part of it, for the purpose of communication or transmission. In fact, only a very small number of autobiographical albums on this subject have been produced, even though these attacks have had a worldwide impact. The authors of these stories about personal memory correspond to what Thierry Groensteen defines as "actorialized narrators". These authors, who are both narrators and actors of the narrative, often on a main title, express themselves in the first person and are represented graphically in the album. This is a homodegetic narrative. While the actorialized narrator was very infrequent in classical comics, he became, according to Thierry Groensteen: "Extremely frequent in contemporary comics, especially in works related to the autobiographical genre (where, by definition, the explicit narrator delivers his own story to us) or to drawn reporting (he is then the witness who reports certain facts and puts them in perspective)"².

Four of the six albums were produced by complete authors, producing texts and drawings, Fred Dewilde, Henrik Rehr, Sandrine Revel and Art Spiegelman. The screenplay for the graphic novel, *American Widow*, was written by Alissa Torres, while the drawing was done by Sungyoon Choi. McCurry, NY, September 11, 2001, is the work of several scriptwriters and a draftsman based on McCurry's photographs and narrative. All stories are written in the first person. In *the Shadow of No towers*, pre-

¹. Lejeune, Philippe, 2015, *Écrire sa vie, du pacte au patrimoine autobiographique*, Paris, Mauconduit, p.103-104.

². Groensteen, Thierry, 2011, *Bande dessinée et narration, Système de la bande dessinée 2*, Paris, Presses universitaires de France, p.106-107.

published in the form of plates in *Forward*, a progressive Jewish weekly newspaper in the United States, and September in the meantime, first appeared in English, *Tuesday, September 11* in Danish. The other albums were directly published in French. This strong presence of French-language comics is a sign of its importance on a global scale. In 2016, 5,305 comic strip books were published in French-speaking Europe, 3,988 of which were new titles.

Atypical albums, on form and content

With the exception of *American Widow*, a long story of 214 pages in black and white, these are relatively short works, especially if we stick to the comic strip part. Indeed, three albums have the unusual feature of being composed of boards dedicated to the testimony of the event and then a second part, of a diverse nature. Thus, Art Spiegelman's view of the events, delivered in ten very dense and large pages, is followed by plates of American comic strips from the early 20th century (*In the Shadow of No Towers*). Fred Dewilde's drawn testimony includes only fifteen plates; it is accompanied by a long text by the author on his experience, divided into paragraphs with evocative titles (*The feeling of being alive, guilt, survivor ties, etc.*). The plates of *McCurry, NY, September 11, 2001*, are followed by a text based on two interviews with the photographer and the reproduction of nine of his double-page photographs. Only a third of the album is devoted to September 11, 2001, to which is added, in about ten pages, McCurry's experience on November 13, 2015 in Paris. *McCurry, NY, September 11, 2001*, also reports on his photographic missions, such as in Afghanistan with Commander Massoud in 1979 and in Pakistan's refugee camps. It was there that he made

the iconic photograph of Sharbat Gula, a young Afghan refugee with green eyes, in 1984 (the discovery in 2016 of the retouching of this and many other photographs caused a scandal). Sandrine Revel's story, less than fifty pages long, appears more classic in its construction. The album is in colour, scattered with many frames and a few onomatopoeias. Nevertheless, the use of photography and the accompanying optical effects highlight the author's intense confusion. Henrik Rehr's story is no longer than that, gathered in its format and narrative, focused on the day of September 11.

Formally, the albums are produced in black and white, or in colour. Album formats are most often atypical, square or very large. The plates are not organized in the form of a waffle iron, i. e. identical frames and arranged regularly. The author's freedom of layout reflects his or her freedom to share a real-life experience, literally out of context.

The recurring presence of photographs in these albums is explained by the medium's strong ability to attest to and maintain the memory of traumatic historical facts. By producing photographs reproducing the scenes of the attacks and the persons concerned (Alissa Torres thus inserts a large number of photographs of her husband at different periods of his life), the authors demonstrate that they do not carry out fictional work, thus distinguishing themselves from the majority production in comic strips. Since the advent of digital technology, the boundaries between drawing and photography have been blurred. A draftsman can now produce images that are very close to reality. The authors treat the images with a relative homogeneity of treatment: as drawings, photographs, whether reproduced identically or redrawn, are accompanied by texts, which can corroborate the clichés. The multiplicity of images, i.e. the addition of photographs to the drawings, makes it possible to densify the memory of the narrated

facts. Although the integration of clichés into albums is a real artistic choice for the authors, their approach is not centred on photography. Such a practice, in use in *McCurry, NY September 11, 2001*, remains exceptional in comics.

Unlike all the other albums, relatively short, *American Widow* is a long story. This may be explained by the fact that the young woman had a different relationship to the terrorist attacks. Indeed, although Fred Dewilde was the only one who was a "direct victim of the attacks", the graphic designer emerges almost unharmed, physically, from the Bataclan; he returns home during the night. Similarly, Art Spiegelman and Henrik Rehr spend long and scary hours, each fearing that they may have lost a child. Nevertheless, each of them is reunited with their loved ones safely at the end of the day on September 11. For Alissa Torres, things went quite differently. Seven months pregnant, her pregnancy continues and lengthens the time of the story. Uncertainty about her husband's death hangs over several days after the terrorist attack. The author desperately searches for him on lists of missing persons, in hospitals, including among unidentified burn victims. This stretching of time is also reflected in the title of the fifth chapter, where Alissa Torres confirmed her husband's death: "September 2001, the rest of the longest month". The young woman is confronted with countless Kafkaesque steps regarding Luis Eduardo Torres' disappearance, including those to have his rights and those of his son recognized. Her husband was Colombian and had not received his permanent resident card in the United States. He had started working the day before the attacks for Cantor Fitzgerald, an investment bank specializing in brokerage, which employed 860 people in New York. None of the 658 employees present on September 11, working on the top floors of the World Trade Center, survived the attacks. Alissa

Torres had to fight for Cantor Fitzgerald to confirm that Luis Eduardo Torres was indeed one of his stockbrokers and compensate his widow accordingly.

Unlike all the other albums, relatively short, *American Widow* is a long story. This may be explained by the fact that the young woman had a different relationship to the terrorist attacks. Indeed, although Fred Dewilde was the only one who was a "direct victim of the attacks", the graphic designer emerges almost unharmed, physically, from the Bataclan; he returns home during the night. Similarly, Art Spiegelman and Henrik Rehr spend long and scary hours, each fearing that they may have lost a child. Nevertheless, each of them is reunited with their loved ones safely at the end of the day on September 11. For Alissa Torres, things went quite differently. Seven months pregnant, her pregnancy continues and lengthens the time of the story. Uncertainty about her husband's death hangs over several days after the terrorist attack. The author desperately searches for him on lists of missing persons, in hospitals, including among unidentified burn victims. This stretching of time is also reflected in the title of the fifth chapter, where Alissa Torres confirmed her husband's death: "September 2001, the Rest of the Longest Month". The young woman is confronted with countless Kafkaesque steps regarding Luis Eduardo Torres' disappearance, including those to have his rights and those of his son recognized. Her husband was Colombian and had not received his permanent resident card in the United States. He had started working the day before the attacks for Cantor Fitzgerald, an investment bank specializing in brokerage, which employed 860 people in New York. None of the 658 employees present on September 11, working on the top floors of the World Trade Center, survived the attacks. Alissa Torres had to fight for Cantor Fitzgerald to confirm that Luis Eduardo Torres was indeed one of his stockbrokers and compensate his widow accordingly.

The iconography is particularly rich and varied, including, in addition to drawings mainly made by the protagonists, photographs and the reproduction of various documents. Some are particularly noteworthy, such as Fred Dewilde's receipt of a statement of complaint for "murder, attempted murder in connection with a terrorist enterprise" (Dewilde, p. 30). Drawing plays an essential role in these stories. It avoids the length of long speeches, even reveals feelings that the author cannot express to the point of paroxysm. All its attributes make sense; the use of colours; the presence or absence of frames, of variable shape and size; the line, which can be modulated both in the drawing itself and in the writing style.

Albums focused on the attacks

The albums begin as soon as the authors are confronted with the attacks, at most a few minutes or even a few hours before. Sandrine Revel is an exception, which takes shape at the top of the Twin Towers, two days before the tragedy and then in front of the Natural History Museum in Manhattan at 9:50 am on September 11. What was then a pleasure trip to New York became a historic event. Fred Dewilde remembers some good memories when he arrived at Le Bataclan. Henrik Rehr draws on an ordinary morning, where his wife goes to work taking their eldest to school while the author stays at home and keeps his youngest son. Then it's the shock. The first plate of September in the meantime is devoted to the retransmission of an aircraft crash on television, announced in several languages. This plate echoes the first squares of *In the Shadow of No Towers*, where Spiegelman draws an American family slumped in front of his television set on September 10, paralyzed on September 11, before falling back into

lethargy afterwards. In *McCurry, NY, September 11, 2001*, the photographer is drawn in his studio when the news of the attack reaches him. He grabs a camera and immediately climbs onto the roof of his building. He began to take his first pictures, like an automaton: "I used to travel for hours to battlefields... But there, no need for a passport. All I had to do was go up a few steps. And it was once at the top... very precisely at that moment... that I stopped thinking. "The next page is an impressive full-page colour photograph. A blue sky, Washington Square Park below, and in the background, a long plume of smoke. Both towers are on fire but standing up. The plate facing it is drawn. It represents Steve McCurry, assisted by his assistant, who continues to take pictures, one of which is inserted under the drawings. The photography is centred on the buildings of the World Trade Center and is as spectacular as the previous one. The first tower collapsed.

The albums tell the story of the protagonists' behaviour during the attacks and how each one tries to cope. Fred Dewilde lay for two hours in the Bataclan pit, terrorized among the wounded and dead, but alive. The drawing reflects his horror; the author is sweaty, swallowed up by black waves with hands, which drag him to the depths. "I don't understand anything, I'm caught up in a wave of terror, a wave of stupor. My eyes meet the eyes of a dead man. No doubt, it's not a game. Now I see the extent of what we are going through. I'm still alive... a living one among the DEAD! "(*ibid.*, not paginated) The story ends after the police assault, when he is released and leaves the Bataclan alone to join his family. This last image is the first one that came to Fred Dewilde's mind when he started his comic book: "Very soon after the 13th I had the final image, it was the first one I had. I, alone, going up Beaumarchais Boulevard, lost, frightened, empty,

shaking. I saw that but not what was there before. The images were too violent, indescribable. By me anyway. " (ibid. p. 34.)

A plate of two *McCurry, NY 11 September 2001* panels links the two tragedies. In the first frame, Steve McCurry is drawn at the Stade de France, while he barely escapes the crowd's panic. He recalls the disappearance of the Twin Towers, always surprising for him: "They remain negative in my memory" (Gi Kim, McCurry, Morvan, Tréfouël, p.35). The second vignette responds to the author's expression of the trauma: "This lack is so present that sometimes, for a quarter of a second, I wonder if they really existed. Fortunately, the municipality proves to us from time to time that we are not totally crazy. " (op. cit., p. 35) The vignette consists of a photograph by Steve McCurry, depicting the New York skyline. Two high-powered blue laser beams rise to the sky in place of the Twin Towers. The album shows the peregrinations of the photographer and his assistant in the neighbourhood affected by the attack, from 11 to 13 September 2001. The drawings and photographs are impressive, revealing a deserted space devastated by the violence of the explosions. The photographer broke in, thwarting police roadblocks, photographing day and night. Steve McCurry refers to a "landscape of apocalypse", when terrorists have for Fred Dewilde the face of the "horsemen of the apocalypse", whom he represents in the form of skeletons.

Almost the entirety of Henrik Rehr's account is devoted to the day of September 11. The author describes his evacuation from the impacted neighbourhood by ambulance, with other parents of very young children. All were taken to Jersey city, the city separated by the Hudson from New York. Henrik Rehr describes his anguish about the possible death of his eldest son, and his extreme relief at the family reunion in the

evening. The family is not allowed to return home for three and a half months, it nomads between several accommodations while the building is secured.

The albums focus more on the victims than on the perpetrators of the attacks. This observation echoes the demonstration recently conducted by G r me Truc. The sociologist has demonstrated the importance of the shift since September 11, 2001 in the media coverage of the attacks and in the social reactions to them, which focus more on the victims than on the terrorists³. Thus, in the salient elements of the story of the September 11 tragedy, we note the almost systematic mention of people who threw themselves into a void, such as Alissa Torres' husband. One of Henrik Rehr's friends tells him that he will never forget "the cries of these poor people plunging towards their death". (Rehr, p.37) In frames made up of photographs of people fleeing the street, Sandrine Revel drew silhouettes floating in the air, superimposed. Art Spiegelman says he saw these scenes on television and reports that teenagers in the same high school as his daughter saw the bodies fall. In *American Widow*, a silent and almost empty plate represents the fall of Luis Eduardo Torres, a small comma in the empty sky, as a counterpoint to a tower. Opposite, these few words from his wife: "The medical examiner said it took you 18 seconds to fall. What were you thinking ? " (Torres, p. 197).

A traumatic memory of the attacks

With the exception of *McCurry, NY September 11, 2001*, which was more conceived for documentary purposes, these albums are part of a traumatic experience.

³. Truc, G r me, 2013, *La participation de la photographie   la construction des grands r cits : le cas des attentats du 11 septembre 2001 et du 11 mars 2004*, (p.115-142), in Denis Peschanski, Denis Mar chal (dir.), *Les chantiers de la m moire*, Bry-sur-Marne, INA  ditions.

Boris Cyrulnik explains that after a more or less long period of astonishment at a traumatic event, the individual remembers images associated with the event that are obsessively imposed on him. In an interview with historian Denis Peschanski, Cyrulnik explains: "Terrible moments are marked more deeply in the memory than happy moments that leave a peaceful trace in the memory, without memory⁴". In this context, the recording of this event in a comic strip allows the author to establish the contours of the traumatic episode experienced, which is frozen by the publication.

Several elements seem to us to argue in favour of this hypothesis. First, these stories focus on the experience of the attacks. Even if they are in a clearly autobiographical process, the period told is very limited with the exception of *American Widow*. The albums are centred and rich in detail on the experience of the attacks, while the events surrounding them are hidden by the authors. This refers to the fact that, as Boris Cyrulnik points out, traumatic memory is composed of two images: "one, hyperaccurate, corresponds to the terror of the trauma. It is biologically impregnated, to the point of lasting a lifetime. This image is surrounded by an imprecise area, because at the time of the trauma, this information had no adaptive value"⁵. The story itself is sometimes very precise about the events experienced, including the physical sensations felt by the authors. The authors highlight their visual memory, thus evoking several times the importance of the dust and smoke that cover the area. Henrik Rehr draws an entirely grey esplanade, adding "This is what a nuclear winter should look like" (Rehr

⁴. Peschanski, Denis, 2012, *Boris Cyrulnik, entretien avec Denis Peschanski, Mémoire et traumatisme : l'individu et la fabrique des grands récits*, Bry-sur-Marne, INA éditions, p.8.

⁵. Lefebvre, Michel, 2013, « Entretien avec Denis Peschanski et Boris Cyrulnik, le traumatisme entre histoire et neurosciences », *Le Monde*, hors-série « 1914-2014, un siècle de guerre », décembre 2013, p.76.

p.9). Steve McCurry remembers ashes getting thicker as he approaches the event centre. Alissa Torres "thinks she's on a snowy day" as she walks towards the burning towers, a feeling identical to McCurry's. Similarly, the evocation of smells, which we know are closely linked to memory, is very frequent. Henrik Rehr points out that "the pungent smell of the ever-lively fire on Ground zero filled the air" (Rehr, p. 41) while Sandrine Revel's fellow travellers call out: "You can smell it?! It smells like burning, my throat is on fire" (Revel, p.37).

The force of the trauma is such that it brings back the wounds of the past. Indeed, many authors refer to previous traumatic events that come to mind and that they associate with the facts present. Thus, Art Spiegelman recalls his father's account of his deportation during the Shoah, an experience he recounted in *Maus*: "I remember my father when he tried to describe the smell of Auschwitz smoke. The best he could have done was to tell me that she was... "indescribable". That's exactly how it smelled over Manhattan after 9/11!" (Spiegelman, p. 2). Sandrine Revel evokes the ever-relenting pain felt since the death of her brother, whose image haunts the album on many occasions. Henrik Rehr relived the dramatic birth of his eldest son, the very one he feared would die on September 11. The child and his mother were then transferred to an intensive care unit. Steve McCurry, in the devastated towers, remembers having almost died several times during his photographic missions. One frame shows him narrowly escaping drowning in Slovenia, another shows him being violently assaulted, etc.

The trauma experienced by the authors is felt in later manifestations that they represent in the stories. All of them, at different stages, have a symptom of post-traumatic stress. This severe anxiety disorder appears following an event that eventually exposed to death. The person with post-traumatic stress disorder may be a direct victim

of the event (such as Fred Dewilde, a recluse at the Bataclan) or a witness to a disaster involving many victims (all other comics authors). The line between victim and witness is sometimes difficult to establish, as in the case of Alissa Torres, widow of a man who disappears in the Twin Towers. The main symptoms of this disorder are insomnia, nightmares, irritability, anger, fear and can lead to pathological behaviour and avoidance. Steve McCurry, who was present at the scene of the attacks to provide a photographic testimony that he considered essential, explains that for a very long time he could not see the pictures he had taken: "I didn't look at my images before... I don't know... a very long time [...] I didn't want to think about that, I didn't want to live that again. It was traumatic. " (McCurry, p. 105). Art Spiegelman is the only author to specifically mention the symptom and associate it with identified manifestations: "I repeat to them that the sky is falling, they look up and tell me that it is just a symptom of my post-traumatic stress disorder" (Spiegelman, p. 2). Two frames further on, he draws his hallucinated face, whirlwinds figured instead of eyes, articulating: "I can still see the tower burning, terrible when it collapses" (Spiegelman, p.2). Fred Dewilde, after the Bataclan shooting test, evokes the anguish that hugs him as soon as the noises reach him. Since the event, he can no longer stand the noise and feels attacked by his little girl's tears. An unexpected noise causes him uncontrollable anxiety and long insomnia. Henrik Rehr explains: "One night, a thunderclap woke me up. I was sure I had heard a plane shortly before that noise, and that a new attack was taking place. It took me an hour to calm my heart rate, and another hour to get back to rest. "Art Spiegelman wrote in 2004 that he was "ready again to completely lose his temporary serenity when he heard a simple needle or dirty bomb fall". " (Spiegelman, introduction, not paginated) Alissa Torres tirelessly dreams of her husband; Sandrine Revel shares hallucinations,

which she materializes in drawing through evanescent silhouettes. Images haunt the authors, particularly that of the World Trade Center towers before or during their destruction. Fred Dewilde writes, after the Bataclan attack: "How do I manage these images that flow and flow back into what I use as my brain? I expect flashes to appear at any time. Is that what it means to be alive after an attack?" (Dewilde, p.28) The Twin Towers are reproduced, in drawing and photography, in McCurry's albums, Revel and Spiegelman. The towers, huge and pixelated, can be found in all the plates of "*In the shadow of No towers*". It is still their photography that closes the album, the last plate of which was made in the summer of 2003. Art Spiegelman has reconstructed what is, for him, the central image of the morning of September 11, what does he say, "neither the photos nor the video images have entered the common memory, but which, three years later, remains engraved under my eyelids" (Spiegelman, introduction, not paginated). This is the glowing skeleton of the North Tower, just before it was sprayed.

Focused on the traumatic experience of the authors, these albums are therefore not didactic. Here, it is not a question of retracing the historical context of the attacks, explaining the actions of the terrorists or even naming the organizations to which they belonged. Rather than reporting overabundant information, the authors choose to highlight their personal feelings, a mixture of amazement, fear and anxiety but also adaptation to the situation. Sandrine Revel lists the emotions felt in a "basic" way: "All these deaths... it causes violent feelings in me: dread, horror, fear... pain for the victims and those who loved them". (Revel p.40) The authors also testify to their misunderstanding and questions about terrorist acts. Fred Dewilde wondered: "How is the decision to take life made? Country or just guy, why do we kill? Are we all slipping into madness, fanaticism? ». Henrik Hehr is more ambivalent, acknowledging that at

first his dominant feeling was anger and, in thought, he had tried many ways to torture a terrorist to death. Yet, shortly afterwards, he confided: "I do not wish to diminish the horrible, inconceivable about the family or friends of the victims, but I find it just as tragic to think that the men behind this infamy had to love their children as much as I love mine. " (Rehr, p.47) With the exception of Spiegelman and McCurry, terrorists are neither identified nor incriminated by the authors. They are, in a way, pushed into the void, they disappear from the album whose main subject remains the trauma felt as a result of the attack. Art Spiegelman and Steve McCurry seem to hold Osama Bin Laden and George W. Bush equally responsible for the September 11, 2001 attacks. Thus, a plate by *McCurry, NY, September 11, 2001* juxtaposes two vignettes, one with the portrait of Osama Bin Laden, the other with that of George W. Bush, without these being formally identified. A text links the two silent vignettes and moves forward, without it being very clear: "all victims of a war of civilizations that exceeded them. "(Gi Kim, McCurry, Morvan, Tréfouël, p.83). Similarly, Art Spiegelman proposes a drawing in which he represents himself "as terrorized" by Al-Qaida as by the government of his country.

These comic strip albums are works of individual memory, which enrich the collective memory of the attacks of 11 September 2001 and 13 November 2015. The personification of albums and the use of individual memories help to identify the reader. The desperate man throwing himself into the void from the Twin Towers is no longer an anonymous man. He now has a family, a story, a face for the reader, that of Alissa Torres' husband. Identification with the protagonists is facilitated by the fact that emotion is very present in these albums. However, as Boris Cyrulnik reminds us,

"without emotion, there is no memory. " (Lefèvre) These stories are an illustration of the implementation of the memory narrative, as Denis Peschanski evokes it, "i. e. the transition from individual memory to the social memory of an important event⁶." Albums bring original and sensitive testimonies into the public domain, based on an interaction between text and image. They reveal a strong link between traumatic events and memorization, in which images, both drawn and photographic, play an essential role.

Isabelle Delorme (Centre d'Histoire de Sciences Po, Paris)

Bibliography :

Comic book albums

Dewilde, Fred, 2016, *Mon Bataclan*, Paris, Lemieux éditeur.

Gi Kim Jung, Morvan Jean-David, Tréfouël Séverine, 2016, *McCurry, NY 11 septembre 2001*, Charleroi, Dupuis.

Guibert Emmanuel, Lefèvre Didier, Lemercier Frédéric, *Le Photographe*, Charleroi, Dupuis, tome 1, 2003, tome 2, 2004, tome 3, 2006, édition intégrale parue en 2008.

Rehr, Henrik, 2003, *Mardi 11 septembre*, traduit par Alain David, Issy-Les-Moulineaux, Vents d'Ouest.

Revel, Sandrine, 2002, *Le 11^e jour*, Paris, Delcourt.

⁶. Rouso, Henry, 2016, *Face au passé. Essais sur la mémoire contemporaine*, Paris, Belin, p.267.

Spiegelman, Art, 2004, *In the Shadow of No Towers*, New York, Pantheon Graphic Library.

Spiegelman, Art, 2004, *À l'ombre des tours mortes*, traduit de l'anglais (américain) par Courier international et Philippe Mikriammos, Bruxelles, Casterman.

Torres, Alissa, 2009, *American Widow*, New York, Villars.

Torres, Alissa, 2009, *Septembre en t'attendant* [2008], traduit de l'anglais (américain) par Fanny Soubiran, Bruxelles, Casterman.

Scientific corpus

Delorme, Isabelle, 2019, *Quand la bande dessinée fait mémoire du XXe siècle. Les récits mémoriels historiques*, Dijon, les Presses du réel.

Groensteen, Thierry, 2011, *Bande dessinée et narration, Système de la bande dessinée 2*, Paris, Presses universitaires de France.

Lefebvre, Michel, 2013, « Entretien avec Denis Peschanski et Boris Cyrulnik, le traumatisme entre histoire et neurosciences », *Le Monde*, hors-série « 1914-2014, un siècle de guerre », décembre 2013, p.76-77.

Lejeune, Philippe, 2015, *Écrire sa vie, du pacte au patrimoine autobiographique*, Paris, Mauconduit.

Peschanski, Denis, 2012, *Boris Cyrulnik, entretien avec Denis Peschanski, Mémoire et traumatisme : l'individu et la fabrique des grands récits*, Bry-sur-Marne, INA éditions.

Rouso, Henry, 2016, *Face au passé. Essais sur la mémoire contemporaine*, Paris, Belin.

Truc, G r me, 2013, *La participation de la photographie   la construction des grands r cits : le cas des attentats du 11 septembre 2001 et du 11 mars 2004*, (p.115-142), in Denis Peschanski, Denis Mar chal (dir.), *Les chantiers de la m moire*, Bry-sur-Marne, INA  ditions.

Truc, G r me, 2016, *Sid rations, Une sociologie des attentats*, Paris, Presses universitaires de France.